Limiting Bias
Promising Practices For Searches

CONTENTS

► Commitment to diversity, equity and inclusion    pg. 2
► Representation in academic medicine           pg. 3
► The science of unconscious bias               pg. 5
► How to combat unconscious bias                pg. 6
► Key links and additional resources            pg. 7
Diversity refers to the variety of personal experiences, values and worldviews that arise from differences of culture and circumstance. Such differences include race, ethnicity, gender, age, religion, language, abilities/disabilities, sexual orientation, gender identity, socioeconomic status, and geographic region, and more.

At UCSF we are committed to the best
Our vision: to be the world’s preeminent health sciences innovator

I. Excellence Requires Diversity

**People who are different from one another bring unique information and experiences**

- Diverse groups are more innovative and creative\(^1\,^2\)
- Papers written by diverse groups have more citations and higher impact factors\(^3\)
- Diverse groups share more information with others in the group\(^4\)

**Employee engagement is a validated predictor of organizational performance**

Diverse workplaces with culturally competent workforces have the highest employee engagement\(^5\,^6\)

### US Census

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Academic Medicine</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>African American</td>
<td>13.4%</td>
<td>3.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic/Latinx</td>
<td>18.5%</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>5.9%</td>
<td>19.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>60.1%</td>
<td>63.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AAMC Faculty Roster, 2018
BY THE NUMBERS

Representation in Academic Medicine

National representation of women in academic medicine

National representation of medical school faculty by percent underrepresented minority (URM¹) status

¹UCSF Definition of URM: Someone whose racial or ethnic makeup is from one of the following: African American / Black; Asian: Filipino, Hmong, or Vietnamese; Hispanic / Latino; Native American / Alaskan Native; Native Hawaiian / Other Pacific Islander; or Two or more races when one or more are from the preceding racial and ethnic categories in this list.

In addition: Women in traditionally male dominated specialties; Males in traditionally female dominated specialties; and Historically marginalized individuals: LGBT, individuals with disabilities

National representation of medical school faculty by percent gender/URM status

AAMC - The State of Women in Academic Medicine, 2018-2019

AAMC Faculty Roster, 2018

AAMC Faculty Roster Snapshot, December 2019
Representation at UCSF

Female faculty pipeline, UCSF

Gender/race/ethnicity
UCSF School of Medicine faculty

URM pipeline, UCSF
We recognize the connection between diversity and innovation. Our goal is to be the workplace of choice for diverse, top-tier talent.

—UCSF’S 2014-2015 PLAN

II. Unconscious Bias May Impede Selecting The Best

“The greatest barrier to achieving gender equity in STEMM is systematic bias, frequently unconscious” - National Academy of Sciences

Social stereotypes that individuals form outside of conscious awareness
- All of us hold unconscious beliefs about various social and identity groups
- Stems from our tendency to organize social worlds by categorizing
- Often incompatible with conscious values

Data we receive from others may be biased
Certain scenarios can activate unconscious stereotypes and attitudes

We all have biases
- Project Implicit: 75% of people have implicit biases or associations
- Unconscious biases tend to map to existing social hierarchies
  - Favor men, Whites, youth, heterosexuals, and physically able
- Males = Science; Females = Liberal Arts

Seminal studies and contemporary research have shown that unconscious bias influences hiring, evaluation, and selection of leaders

Evaluation of CVs
- Selection of “Brian over Karen” 2x as often
- 50% higher call back rate if named “Emily and Gregg” vs “Lakisha and Jamal”
- Whites & Hispanics benefit from quality resume; Blacks evaluated negatively even with quality resume
  - Occupational stereotypes: Asians high status, Blacks and Hispanics lower status

Evaluation of reference letters
- More “standout” adjectives for males
- Female letters shorter, contained more “doubt raisers” & focus on teaching; males as researchers

Bias into academic pathways
- Faculty more likely to respond to research inquiry requests from fictional White male doctoral students than any other group
- When reviewing identical resumes, research faculty rated male students as more competent than females, with higher starting salaries
- Biases about rating of males and females on a math lab task was related to IAT sex-related beliefs

Evaluation of CVs
- “Whitened Resumes”: racial minorities’ attempts to downplay ethnic/racial cues
  - Less resume whitening if employer specifies valuing diversity

Motherhood Penalty
- Mothers perceived as less competent; offered lower starting salaries and less likely to be hired & promoted compared to fathers & employees without children
- Fathers not penalized; at times, there is a “fatherhood premium”
  - Fathers less likely to be laid off during Covid-19 than all other groups, including mothers and people without children

Evaluation of reference letters
- More “standout” adjectives for males
- Female letters shorter, contained more “doubt raisers” & focus on teaching; males as researchers

Bias into academic pathways
- Faculty more likely to respond to research inquiry requests from fictional White male doctoral students than any other group
- When reviewing identical resumes, research faculty rated male students as more competent than females, with higher starting salaries
- Biases about rating of males and females on a math lab task was related to IAT sex-related beliefs
Academic review

NIH Review

- Black applicants 10% less likely than Whites to receive NIH investigator initiated research grants.\(^{21}\)

Part of the disparity due to topic choice.\(^{22}\)

- Black applicants more likely to be associated with topics like health disparities, disease prevention and intervention, socioeconomic factors, healthcare, lifestyle, psychosocial, adolescent, and risk.

III. How to combat unconscious bias

On the individual level

Enhance internal motivation to reduce bias
- Recognize unconscious bias (IAT)

Implicit bias is changeable.\(^{23}\)
- Knowledge of bias can reduce its impacts
- New information can cause reinterpretation of scenario
- Priming has an effect: Can counter stereotypes
- Enhance perspective taking and communication skills
- Facilitated discussions with colleagues from diverse groups

On the institutional level

- Concrete, objective indicators & outcomes reduce standard stereotypes.\(^{24-26}\)
- Decreasing ambiguity about individual contributions to joint outcome reduces bias in performance evaluation.\(^{27}\)
- Use structured interviews and objective evaluation criteria.\(^{28,25}\)
- Commit to specific credentials before reviewing applications.\(^{29}\)
- Allow sufficient time as bias stronger when under time pressure.\(^{23,28,30}\)
- Accountability for decision makers.\(^{31-32}\)
- Provide training workshops.\(^{30}\)
Key Links and Additional Resources

Office of Diversity and Outreach  
https://diversity.ucsf.edu/

UCSF Faculty Equity Advisors  
https://diversity.ucsf.edu/faculty-equity-advisor

UCSF Leadership Equity Advances Diversity (LEAD) Advancing Faculty Diversity Grant  
https://diversity.ucsf.edu/advancing-faculty-diversity-grant-lead

University of California Coro Project: Leading with Diversity: Strategies for Recruitment and Retention  
https://www.ucop.edu/human-resources/coro/uc-coro-cohort-projects.html

University of California: Guidelines for Addressing Race and Gender Equity in Academic Programs in Compliance with Proposition 209  
https://www.ucop.edu/uc-legal/_files/guidelines-equity.pdf

References