Limiting Bias
Promising Practices For Searches

CONTENTS

- Commitment to diversity, equity and inclusion  pg. 2
- Representation in academic nursing  pg. 2
- Representation at UCSF  pg. 3-4
- The science of unconscious bias  pg. 5
- How to combat unconscious bias  pg. 6
- Key links and additional resources  pg. 7
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA DIVERSITY STATEMENT

Endorsed as Amended by the President of the University of California
August 17, 2010  http://www.universityofcalifornia.edu/diversity/diversity.html

Diversity refers to the variety of personal experiences, values and worldviews that arise from differences of culture and circumstance. Such differences include race, ethnicity, gender, age, religion, language, abilities/disabilities, sexual orientation, gender identity, socioeconomic status, and geographic region, and more.

AT UCSF WE ARE COMMITTED TO THE BEST
Our vision: to be the world’s preeminent health sciences innovator

I. Excellence Requires Diversity

People who are different from one another bring unique information and experiences

- Diverse groups are more innovative and creative
- Papers written by diverse groups have more citations and higher impact factors
- Diverse groups share more information with others in the group

Employee engagement is a validated predictor of organizational performance

Diverse workplaces with culturally competent workforces have the highest employee engagement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>US CENSUS</th>
<th>ACADEMIC NURSING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>African American</td>
<td>13.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic/Latinx</td>
<td>18.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>5.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>60.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>49.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

American Association of Colleges of Nursing, 2019
BY THE NUMBERS

Nursing Representation at UCSF

Gender/race/ethnicity
UCSF School of Nursing faculty

The UCSF definition of Underrepresented Minority is:
Someone whose racial or ethnic makeup is from one of
the following; African American / Black; Asian: Filipino,
Hmong, or Vietnamese; Hispanic / Latinx; Native
American / Alaskan Native; Native Hawaiian / Other
Pacific Islander; or Two or more races when one or more
are from the preceding racial and ethnic categories in
this list.

In addition: Women in traditionally male dominated
specialties; Males in traditionally female dominated
specialties; and Historically marginalized individuals:
LGBT, individuals with disabilities

Limiting Bias | Promising Practices For Searches
Faculty Pipelines at UCSF

Female faculty pipeline, UCSF

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All Faculty</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Professors</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Professors</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full professors</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dept Chairs</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deans</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

URM pipeline, UCSF

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residents</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postdocs</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chairs</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deans</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

August 2019
We recognize the connection between diversity and innovation. Our goal is to be the workplace of choice for diverse, top-tier talent.

- UCSF’S 2014-2015 PLAN

II. Unconscious Bias May Impede Selecting The Best

“The greatest barrier to achieving gender equity in STEM is systematic bias, frequently unconscious” - National Academy of Sciences

Social stereotypes that individuals form outside of conscious awareness

- All of us hold unconscious beliefs about various social and identity groups
- Stems from our tendency to organize social worlds by categorizing
- Often incompatible with conscious values

Data we receive from others may be biased

Certain scenarios can activate unconscious stereotypes and attitudes

We all have biases

- Project Implicit: 75% of people have implicit biases or associations
- Unconscious biases tend to map to existing social hierarchies
  - Favor men, Whites, youth, heterosexuals, and physically able
  - Males = Science; Females = Liberal Arts

Seminal studies and contemporary research have shown that unconscious bias influences hiring, evaluation, and selection of leaders

Evaluation of CVs

- Selection of “Brian over Karen” 2x as often
- 50% higher call back rate if named “Emily and Gregg” vs “Lakisha and Jamal”
- Whites & Hispanics benefit from quality resume; Blacks evaluated negatively even with quality resume
  - Occupational stereotypes: Asians high status, Blacks and Hispanics lower status

Evaluation of reference letters

- More “standout” adjectives for males
- Female letters shorter, contained more “doubt raisers” & focus on teaching; males as researchers

Bias into academic pathways

- Faculty more likely to respond to research inquiry requests from fictional White male doctoral students than any other group
- When reviewing identical resumes, research faculty rated male students as more competent than females, with higher starting salaries
- Biases about rating of males and females on a math lab task was related to IAT sex-related beliefs
### Academic review

#### NIH Review
- Black applicants 10% less likely than Whites to receive NIH investigator initiated research grants \(^{21}\)

#### Part of the disparity due to topic choice \(^{22}\)
- Black applicants more likely to be associated with topics like health disparities, disease prevention and intervention, socioeconomic factors, healthcare, lifestyle, psychosocial, adolescent, and risk

### III. How to combat unconscious bias

#### On the individual level
- Enhance internal motivation to reduce bias
  - Recognize unconscious bias (IAT)
- Implicit bias is changeable \(^{23}\)
  - Knowledge of bias can reduce its impacts
  - New information can cause reinterpretation of scenario
  - Priming has an effect: Can counter stereotypes
  - Enhance perspective taking and communication skills
  - Facilitated discussions with colleagues from diverse groups

#### On the institutional level
- Concrete, objective indicators & outcomes reduce standard stereotypes \(^{24-26}\)
- Decreasing ambiguity about individual contributions to joint outcome reduces bias in performance evaluation \(^{27}\)
- Use structured interviews and objective evaluation criteria \(^{28,25}\)
- Commit to specific credentials before reviewing applications \(^{29}\)
- Allow sufficient time as bias stronger when under time pressure \(^{23,28,30}\)
- Accountability for decision makers \(^{31-32}\)
- Provide training workshops \(^{30}\)
Key Links and Additional Resources

Office of Diversity and Outreach
https://diversity.ucsf.edu/
UCSF Faculty Equity Advisors
https://diversity.ucsf.edu/faculty-equity-advisor
UCSF Leadership Equity Advances Diversity (LEAD) Advancing Faculty Diversity Grant
https://diversity.ucsf.edu/advancing-faculty-diversity-grant-lead
University of California Coro Project: Leading with Diversity: Strategies for Recruitment and Retention
https://www.ucop.edu/human-resources/coro/uc-coro-cohort-projects.html
University of California: Guidelines for Addressing Race and Gender Equity in Academic Programs in Compliance with Proposition 209
https://www.ucop.edu/uc-legal/_files/guidelines-equity.pdf
University of California Diversity Reports, Key Resources and Initiatives, and Data
https://www.ucop.edu/faculty-diversity/index.html
AAMC Unconscious Bias Resources for Health Professionals
https://www.aamc.org/what-we-do/diversity-inclusion/unconscious-bias-training
AAMC E-learning seminar: The Science of Unconscious Bias
https://www.aamc.org/initiatives/leadership/recruitment/178420/unconscious_bias.html
NIH Scientific Workforce Diversity Toolkit
Implicit Association Test:
https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/

References